



Florida Department of TRANSPORTATION

**Office of Inspector General
Kristofer B. Sullivan, Inspector General**

DocuSigned by:
Kristofer B. Sullivan
66AAC6E338F64F4...
October 24, 2024

Audit Report No. 24P-010
Performance Measures Fiscal Year 2022-2023

What We Did

The Office of Inspector General conducted a Performance Measures Assessment pursuant to section 20.055(2)(b), Florida Statutes, (2023). We assessed the validity and reliability of four performance measures reported in the 2024-25 Department of Transportation’s (Department) Long Range Program Plan (LRPP) for Fiscal Year 2022-2023.

What We Found

We assessed the following four performance measures (see Table 1):

Table 1 – Assessment of LRPP Performance Measures

Responsible Office	LRPP Performance Measure Reviewed	Valid	Reliable
Materials Office	1. Percentage of state highway system pavement meeting Department standards	Yes	Yes
Maintenance Office	2. Percentage of FDOT-maintained bridges which meet Department standards.	Yes	Yes
Florida Commission for the Transportation Disadvantaged	3. Average cost per one-way trip provided for the transportation disadvantaged.	Yes	Yes
Transportation Data and Analytics Office	4. Lane miles maintained on the State Highway System (Turnpike only)	Yes	Yes

Source: Auditor testing

We determined the performance measure in the Materials Office is a valid indicator of that which it purports to measure. Additionally, **we determined** the data that is utilized for the measure is reliable due to the process controls in place, quality assurance process, and the data collection methodology.

We determined the performance measure in the Maintenance Office is a valid indicator of that which it purports to measure. Additionally, **we determined** the data that is utilized for the measure is reliable due to the process controls in place, quality assurance process, and the data collection methodology.

**Office of Inspector General
Florida Department of Transportation**

We determined the performance measure in the Florida Commission for the Transportation Disadvantaged Office is a valid indicator of that which it purports to measure. Additionally, **we determined** the data that is utilized for the measure is reliable due to the process controls in place, quality assurance process, and the data collection methodology.

We determined the performance measure in the Transportation Data and Analytics Office is a valid indicator of that which it purports to measure. Additionally, **we determined** the data that is utilized for the measure is reliable due to the process controls in place, quality assurance process, and the data collection methodology.

What We Recommend

We do not have any recommendations at this time.

**Office of Inspector General
Florida Department of Transportation**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

BACKGROUND AND INTRODUCTION	4
RESULTS OF REVIEW	5
Finding 1 – Percentage of State Highway System Pavement Meeting Department Standards	5
Finding 2 – Percentage of FDOT-maintained Bridges which Meet Department Standards	6
Finding 3 – Average Cost Per One-way Trip Provided for the Transportation Disadvantaged	6
Finding 4 – Lane Miles Maintained on the State Highway System (Turnpike Only)	6
APPENDIX A – Purpose, Scope, and Methodology	8
APPENDIX B – Management Response	9
DISTRIBUTION	10
PROJECT TEAM	11
STATEMENT OF ACCORDANCE	11

**Office of Inspector General
Florida Department of Transportation**

BACKGROUND AND INTRODUCTION

The Government Accountability and Performance Act of 1994 requires state agencies to implement performance-based program budgeting, which includes establishing legislatively approved performance measures and standards. Additionally, Section 216.013, Florida Statutes, (F.S.) (2023), requires state agencies to develop a Long-Range Program Plan (LRPP) that is policy-based, priority driven, accountable, and developed through careful examination and justification of all agency programs. The statute requires the submission of the LRPP, including prior year performance data, no later than September 30 of each year.

Section 20.055(2)(b), F.S. (2023), requires the Office of Inspector General (OIG) to assess the validity and reliability of the performance measures information reported by the Department of Transportation (Department) and make recommendations for improvement. To comply with these requirements, we reviewed four legislatively approved Fiscal Year (FY) 2022-23 performance measures reported in the Department's FY 2024-25 LRPP.

For this assessment, we used the following definitions from the FY 2024-25 LRPP:

Validity - The appropriateness of the measuring instrument in relation to the purpose for which it is being used.

Reliability - The extent to which the measuring procedure yields the same results on repeated trials and data are complete and sufficiently error free for the intended use.

As part of our assessment, we reviewed each responsible office's measure procedures and the Department's LRPP to identify the intended purpose for each measure reviewed. We also identified when each measure was last assessed and the results to determine the measures to review.

The Office of Work Program & Budget, Materials Office, and Maintenance Office measures were last assessed in 2017. In the 2017 OIG Advisory Report No. 17P-3001, the two measures were determined to be valid and reliable measures for the performance of the program areas measured.

The Florida Commission for the Transportation Disadvantaged Office LRPP measure was updated for the period of FY 2023-24. As such, it was included in this audit due to an update in the performance measure language to replace "requested" with "provided."

The Transportation Data and Analytics Office LRPP measure was last assessed in 2019. In the 2019 OIG Advisory Report No. 19P-3001, the measure was determined to be a valid and reliable measure for the performance of the program area measured.

**Office of Inspector General
Florida Department of Transportation**

RESULTS OF REVIEW

As shown in Table 2, we determined:

- all four performance measures were valid indicators of that which they purported to measure;
- all four performance measures were valid measures of the performance of the Department; and
- all four performance measures provided reliable data that supported what was being measured.

Table 2 - Assessment of Long-Range Program Plan Performance Measures

Responsible Office	LRPP Performance Measure Reviewed	Valid	Reliable
Materials Office	Percentage of State Highway System Pavement Meeting Department Standards	Yes	Yes
Maintenance Office	Percentage of FDOT-maintained Bridges which Meet Department Standards	Yes	Yes
Florida Commission for the Transportation Disadvantaged	Average Cost Per One-way Trip Provided for the Transportation Disadvantaged	Yes	Yes
Transportation Data and Analytics Office	Lane Miles Maintained on the State Highway System (Turnpike Only)	Yes	Yes

Source: Auditor testing

Finding 1 – Percentage of State Highway System Pavement Meeting Department Standards

We determined the performance measure in the Materials Office for the percentage of state highway system pavement meeting Department standards is a valid indicator of that which it purports to measure. Additionally, **we determined** the data is reliable due to the process controls in place, and the collection methodology for this measure is consistent.

The data is supplied by the Pavement Condition Survey Operators/Raters in the Pavement Condition Survey. Once the state Pavement Condition Survey is complete, the Pavement Management team uses programs written in the Statistical Analysis System to ensure the data is accurate. We reviewed the procedures in place and found they provide guidance for ensuring the reliability of the data. The Materials Office finalizes the data and provides the Office of Work Program and Budget with the necessary data to report the measure. The Materials Office implements sufficient controls and procedures to promote data accuracy for the performance measure.

**Office of Inspector General
Florida Department of Transportation**

Finding 2 – Percentage of FDOT-maintained Bridges which Meet Department Standards

We determined the performance measure in the Maintenance Office for the percentage of FDOT-maintained bridges meeting Department standards is a valid indicator of that which it purports to measure. Additionally, **we determined** the data is reliable due to the process controls in place, and the collection methodology for this measure is consistent.

The AASHTOWare BrM¹ system contains the inspection data and inventory of state-owned bridges. On the last day of the FY, a query is executed where the data is extracted into an Excel spreadsheet that contains the count of bridges that meet the criteria. We reviewed the desk procedure in place and found that it provides guidance for ensuring the reliability of the data. The Maintenance Office finalizes the data and provides the Office of Work Program and Budget with the necessary data to report the measure. The Maintenance Office provides sufficient controls and procedures to promote data accuracy for the performance measure.

Finding 3 – Average Cost Per One-way Trip Provided for the Transportation Disadvantaged

We determined the performance measure in the Florida Commission for the Transportation Disadvantaged (CTD) Office for the average cost per one-way trip provided for transportation disadvantaged is a valid indicator of that which it purports to measure. Additionally, **we determined** the data is reliable due to the process controls in place, and the collection methodology for this measure is consistent.

The data from the invoices submitted by the Community Transportation Coordinator for trips provided is reviewed and compiled into one Excel workbook. The total trips are included as part of the Commission's Annual Performance Report. We reviewed the desk procedure in place and found that it provides guidance for ensuring the reliability of the data. The CTD Office finalizes the data and provides the Office of Work Program and Budget with the necessary data to report the measure. The CTD Office provides sufficient controls and procedures to promote data accuracy for the performance measure.

Finding 4 – Lane Miles Maintained on the State Highway System (Turnpike Only)

We determined the performance measure in the Transportation Data and Analytics (TDA) Office for the lane miles maintained on the State Highway System (Turnpike only) is a valid indicator of that which it purports to measure. Additionally, **we determined** the data is reliable due to the process controls in place, and the collection methodology for this measure is consistent.

¹ AASHTOWare BrM is the Maintenance Office bridge maintenance system housing performance data.

**Office of Inspector General
Florida Department of Transportation**

The District Statistics Administrator enters the data into the Roadway Characteristics Inventory system, generates a report from the database, and transfers the data to an Excel spreadsheet. The information in the template/Excel spreadsheet contains calculations for the current and future FY. We reviewed the desk procedure in place and found that it provides guidance for ensuring the reliability of the data. The TDA Office finalizes the data and provides the Office of Work Program and Budget with the necessary data to report the measure. The TDA Office provides sufficient controls and procedures to promote data accuracy for the performance measure.

**Office of Inspector General
Florida Department of Transportation**

APPENDIX A – Purpose, Scope, and Methodology

The **purpose** of this engagement was to meet the statutory requirement in Section 20.055, F. S., (2023), to assess the validity and reliability of legislatively approved performance measures and make recommendations for improvements, if needed.

The **scope** of the assessment included all information and documentation related to the following four performance measures reported in the Department’s 2024-25 LRPP for the FY 2022-23:

- Percentage of state highway system pavement meeting Department standards;
- Percentage of FDOT-maintained bridges which meet Department standards;
- Average cost per one-way trip provided for transportation disadvantaged; and
- Lane miles maintained on the state highway system (Turnpike only).

The **methodology** included:

- reviewing applicable statutes, rules, and procedures;
- reviewing prior advisory reports and working papers;
- interviewing appropriate Department management and staff regarding the performance measure processes;
- reviewing data sources, data collection, measure definitions, and methodologies; and
- testing of available data.

**Office of Inspector General
Florida Department of Transportation**

APPENDIX B – Management Response

Florida Commission for the Transportation Disadvantaged

On October 14, 2024, the OIG received the following response from Karen Somerset, Assistant Executive Director of the CTD Office:

We reviewed the Preliminary and Tentative (P&T) report and have no further comments. We appreciate your staff's support and professionalism during this review.

Office of Policy

On October 14, 2024, the OIG received the following email response from Regina Colson, Transportation Performance Measures Coordinator of the Systems Forecasting & Trends Office:

We received the report and have no comments.

Materials Office

On October 14, 2024, the OIG received the following email response from Sue Zheng, P.E., Materials Office Director:

We are good with the report.

Transportation Data and Analytics Office

On October 15, 2024, the OIG received the following email response from Edward Hutchinson, Transportation Data and Analytics Manager of the Civil Integrated Management Office:

I have reviewed the OIG Assignment 24P-010: Performance Measures FY 2022-2023 Audit Preliminary & Tentative Report. I found the report to be accurate and correct.

Maintenance Office

On October 16, 2024, the OIG received the following response from Lance Grace, P.E., Maintenance Office Director:

Thanks for the opportunity to review the results and work with your team on this audit. We received the report and have no comments.

**Office of Inspector General
Florida Department of Transportation**

DISTRIBUTION

Responsible Manager:

David Darm, Executive Director, Commission for Transportation Disadvantaged
Ed Hutchinson, Transportation Data and Analytics Manager
Lance Grace, P.E., Director of Maintenance
Sue Zheng, P.E., Office of Materials Director
Dana Reiding, Manager, Forecasting and Trends Office
Regina Colson, Performance Coordinator, Office of Chief Planner

Internal Distribution:

Jared W. Perdue, P.E., Secretary, Department of Transportation
Leda Kelly, Chief of Staff
Will Watts, P.E., Assistant Secretary for Engineering and Operations
Dan Hurtado, P.E., Chief Engineer of Production
Rudy Powell, P.E., Chief Engineer of Operations
Lisa Saliba, Assistant Secretary for Finance and Administration
Julie Adamson, Director of Office Work Program & Budget
Kim Holland, P.E., Assistant Secretary for Strategic Development
Huiwei Shen, Chief Planner
Rebekah Davis, General Counsel
Trey Tillander, P.E., Executive Director of Transportation Technology
L.K. Nandam, P.E., District One Secretary
Greg Evans, P.E., District Two Secretary
Phillip Gainer, P.E., District Three Secretary
Steven C. Braun, P.E., District Four Secretary
John E. Tyler, P.E., District Five Secretary
Stacy Miller, P.E., District Six Secretary
David Gwynn, P.E., District Seven Secretary
Nicola Liquori, CPA, Executive Director, Florida's Turnpike Enterprise

External Distribution:

Melinda Miguel, Chief Inspector General, Executive Office of the Governor
Sherrill Norman, Auditor General, State of Florida
Jamie Christian, Florida Division Administrator, Federal Highway Administration
Ralph Yoder, Executive Director, Florida Transportation Commission

**Office of Inspector General
Florida Department of Transportation**

PROJECT TEAM

Engagement was conducted by:
Keisha Larkin, Auditor

Under the supervision of:
Paul Lowery, Senior Audit Supervisor
Amy Furney, Deputy Audit Director for Performance and Information Technology
Joseph W. Gilboy, Director of Audit

Approved by:
Kristofer B. Sullivan, Inspector General

STATEMENT OF ACCORDANCE

The Department's mission is to provide a safe transportation system that ensures the mobility of people and goods, enhances economic prosperity, and preserves the quality of our environment and communities.

The Office of Inspector General's mission is to provide independent and objective investigative and audit services that promote accountability, integrity, and efficiency within the Florida Department of Transportation and its partners.

This work product was prepared pursuant to section 20.055, Florida Statutes, in accordance with the Association of Inspectors General *Principles and Standards for Offices of Inspector General*, and conforms with The Institute of Internal Auditors' *International Standards for the Professional Practice of Internal Auditing*.

Please address inquiries regarding this report to the Department's Office of Inspector General at (850) 410-5800.