

# COMMISSION FOR THE TRANSPORTATION DISADVANTAGED



## Business Meeting Agenda July 17, 2024 1:00 PM until Completion

*Dr. Phillip Stevens, Chair  
Christinne Gray, Vice Chair  
Lillian Barrios, Commissioner  
Krysta Carter (DOEA), Commissioner  
Robert Doyle (DBS), Commissioner  
Taylor Hatch (APD), Commissioner  
Renee Knight, Commissioner  
Melissa Smith (FDOT), Commissioner  
Dr. Robin Tellez, Commissioner*

[Join the meeting now](#)

(Microsoft Teams)

Conference Call-In Number: 1-850-739-5589

Conference Code: 406746724#

Item #	Agenda Item	Speaker(s)
I.	Call to Order	Chair Phil Stevens
II.	Pledge of Allegiance	Chair Stevens
III.	Introduction of Commissioners	Commissioners
IV.	Public Comments (Comments limited to the current agenda items)	Public
	<b>Action Items</b>	
V.	Approval of June 3, 2024, Meeting Minutes	Chair Stevens
VI.	FY 2024-25 Shirley Conroy Rural Area Capital Assistance Grant Recommendations	Karen Somerset, CTD Assistant Executive Director
VII.	Annual Operating Report (AOR) Study Final Report	Casey Perkins, Thomas Howell Ferguson
	<b>Information Items</b>	
VIII.	Executive Director Report	David Darm
IX.	Commissioners Reports	Commissioners
X.	Public Comments	Public
XI.	Adjournment	Chair Stevens
	New Board Member Orientation: August 7, 2024, 1:00pm – Tallahassee	

	Next Meeting: September 25, 2024 – West Palm Beach	
--	--	--

When operating under Florida’s Government in the Sunshine Law, the Florida Supreme Court recognizes the importance of public participation in open meetings. The Commission provides that right of access at each public meeting and adheres to Chapter 286.011, Florida Statutes. This meeting will be recorded, and a summary of the discussion will be published at a future date.

Members of the public interested in speaking during the “Public Comments” segments are encouraged to complete the attached public comment card and return to David Darm prior to the meeting date at: [David.Darm@dot.state.fl.us](mailto:David.Darm@dot.state.fl.us). The chair will call on each speaker in the order public comment cards are received. Public comments are limited to five (5) minutes per speaker.

In accordance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA), and Chapter 286.26, Florida Statutes, persons in need of special accommodation to participate in the meeting (including an agenda) shall email David Darm or contact our office listed below, at least 48 hours before the meeting:

Commission for the Transportation Disadvantaged  
605 Suwannee Street, MS-49  
Tallahassee, FL 32399-0450  
(850) 410-5703 or (800) 983-2435  
(850) 410-5708 (TDD/TTY).  
This meeting is subject to change upon the chair’s request.

**State of Florida**  
**Commission for the Transportation Disadvantaged**  
**Commission Business Meeting**

**MEETING DATE:** July 17, 2024

**AGENDA ITEM:**

IV. and X. Public Comments

**BACKGROUND INFORMATION:**

When operating under Florida's Government in the Sunshine Law, the Florida Supreme Court recognizes the importance of public participation in open meetings. The Commission provides that right of access at each public meeting and adheres to Chapter 286.011, Florida Statutes.

The Commission facilitates two "Public Comments" segments on its agenda. For participants interested in providing public comments, the Commission requests speakers complete the attached public comment form and return to David Darm prior to the meeting date at [David.Darm@dot.state.fl.us](mailto:David.Darm@dot.state.fl.us). The chairman will call on speakers in the order public comment cards are received.

Participants planning to speak during the first public comments segment (Item VI) of the agenda must direct their remarks to agenda items only. The Commission welcomes input on any topic during the second public comments segment (Item XIII) of the agenda. Pursuant to Commission Rule 41-2.018, F.A.C., all speakers are limited to five minutes per public comment.

**ATTACHMENT:**

Public Comment Form



# Commission for the Transportation Disadvantaged PUBLIC COMMENT FORM

## Transportation Disadvantaged

Instructions:

1. Complete comment form, including your address. PLEASE TYPE OR PRINT
2. Email comment card to [David.Darm@dot.state.fl.us](mailto:David.Darm@dot.state.fl.us) or provide at Commission Business Meeting
3. The chairman will call on speakers in the order comment cards are received. Please indicate below whether you plan on participating via webinar or conference call.
4. Comments must be limited to five (5) minutes per speaker.

How will you be participating in this meeting? Webinar \_\_\_\_\_ Conference Call \_\_\_\_\_

Name \_\_\_\_\_

E-Mail \_\_\_\_\_

Phone \_\_\_\_\_

Address \_\_\_\_\_

City \_\_\_\_\_

Zip Code \_\_\_\_\_ County \_\_\_\_\_

Representing \_\_\_\_\_

Subject \_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

Support \_\_\_\_\_ Oppose \_\_\_\_\_ Neutral \_\_\_\_\_

**State of Florida**  
**Commission for the Transportation Disadvantaged**  
**Commission Business Meeting**

**MEETING DATE:** July 17, 2024

**AGENDA ITEM:**

V. Approval of Minutes – June 3, 2024

**BACKGROUND:**

The Commission held its business meeting at the Embassy Suites Hotel in Tampa, FL on June 3, 2024. The minutes of that meeting are attached to this packet.

**ATTACHMENTS:**

Minutes of the June 3, 2024, Commission Business Meeting

**EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR RECOMMENDATION/MOTION:**

Approve Minutes from June 3, 2024 Commission Business Meeting.

## MEETING SUMMARY

### Commission for the Transportation Disadvantaged Commission Business Meeting

Embassy Suites  
Tampa, Florida 33612

June 3, 2024  
1:00 PM

<i>Commissioners Present</i>	<i>Commissioners Absent</i>
Dr. Phillip Stevens, Chair	Renee Knight
Christinne Gray, Vice Chair	
Lillian Barrios	
Krysta Carter	
Robert Doyle	
Taylor Hatch	
Melissa Smith	
Dr. Robin Tellez	

#### **Call to Order**

Chair Stevens called the meeting to order. Executive Director David Darm called the roll. A quorum was present.

#### **Pledge of Allegiance**

Chair Stevens led the Pledge of Allegiance.

#### **Welcome and Introductions**

Chair Stevens invited the Commissioners to introduce themselves. This included four new board members representing the Florida Department of Elder Affairs (Commissioner Carter), Florida Division of Blind Services (Commissioner Doyle), Florida Agency for Persons with Disabilities (Commissioner Hatch), and Florida Department of Transportation (Commissioner Smith). He informed participants that the meeting was being recorded and all feedback received, including comments within the webinar chat box, will be reflected in the meeting minutes.

#### **Public Comments**

Janice Ancrum, President and CEO of the Nassau County Council on Aging, spoke on the agenda item pertaining to the Community Transportation Coordinator (CTC) designation for Nassau County. She expressed gratitude for being entrusted as the CTC for the past 42 years and acknowledged the Council's successful provision of transportation services. However, the Council announced a decision to step down due to the organization's growth and evolving community needs. This decision, though not taken lightly, aims to allow focus on the core mission of assisting seniors who are aging in place. Ms. Ancrum assured the Commission that the council will assist the new transportation provider in a smooth transition.

#### **Approval of March 20, 2024, Meeting Minutes**

Chair Stevens requested a motion to approve the minutes from the March 20, 2024, meeting.

**ACTION TAKEN:** Commissioner Gray moved, and Commissioner Hatch seconded the motion, to approve the minutes from March 20, 2024, meeting. The motion carried unanimously.

### **Community Transportation Coordinator (CTC) Designation- Nassau County**

Chair Stevens informed the new Commissioners of their responsibility to approve the CTC for each county or multi-county service area in the state. CTCs arrange transportation services for the TD population, typically through five-year contracts. The designated official planning agency facilitates a procurement process to recommend the entity to serve as the CTC.

Summer Jones from the Northeast Florida Regional Council presented the recommendation for the CTC designation of Nassau County. The Council on Aging notified the Commission of their resignation effective September 30, 2024, prompting a request for proposals (RFP) for a new CTC. The Jacksonville Transportation Authority (JTA) submitted the only response to the RFP. On March 28, 2024, the Nassau County Transportation Disadvantaged Local Coordinating Board recommended JTA as the CTC. This recommendation was unanimously approved by the Northeast Florida Regional Council Executive Committee on April 4, 2024. Therefore, the recommendation is for JTA to serve as Nassau County's CTC beginning on October 1, 2024.

Chair Stevens requested a motion to approve JTA to serve as the CTC for Nassau County.

**ACTION TAKEN:** Commissioner Doyle moved, and Commissioner Barrios seconded the motion, to approve JTA as the CTC for Nassau County. The motion carried unanimously.

### **Innovative Service Development (ISD) Grant for FY 2024-25**

Commissioner Tellez presented an overview of the ISD Grant, a competitive grant program aimed at testing innovative ways to serve the Transportation Disadvantaged (TD) population. The grant objectives include: 1) improving TD riders' access to critical activities within the community, such as employment, healthcare, etc.; 2) enhancing regional (cross-county) mobility options; and 3) reducing barriers to accessing fixed-route transit systems. For Fiscal Year 2024-25, the Florida Legislature appropriated \$3 million to the ISD grant program, which is half of what was appropriated for the previous year's budget. The Commission can award up to \$750,000 for a single community project and up to \$1.5 million for regional projects. In December 2023, the Commission adopted a policy that limits project eligibility to no more than four years of funding.

Ten proposals were received for a total of \$3.9 million in funding requests for FY24-25. Eight applications represented a continuation of current year projects and two represented new project proposals. Current year projects were given first consideration in the evaluation process. The review subcommittee was chaired by Commissioner Tellez and included Commissioner Carter, Gabrielle Matthews (FDOT), and Kent Carroll (APD). The subcommittee used a scoring rubric to evaluate each project application and were presented with three funding options for consideration: 1) award funding based on current year performance (i.e., services delivered during FY23-24); 2) award funding based on the subcommittee's evaluation scores; and 3) award funding with a 6.8% reduction across all funding requests to remain within budget. The subcommittee recommended replacing the third option with an option that considers funding based on a combination of project performance and evaluation scores. This recommendation (OPTION 3) included funding for all eight projects from the current year and one new project in Martin County.

David Darm discussed some of the factors that were considered as part of the funding options presented to the Commission. Pinellas's proposal included \$25,000 to continue providing urgent, same-day services, which was not included in all three funding options because those services expired based on the Commission's 4-year limit policy. He also discussed challenges confronting projects related to procurement of transportation network companies (TNCs). This year, Lake County was not able to procure a TNC and deliver services in FY23-24; Leon County experienced a similar delay during its first year of funding (FY22-23) and has invoiced a small amount for its second year

(FY23-24). The Commission was tasked with approving one of the three funding options to allocate \$3 million for the Fiscal Year 2024-25, starting July 1, 2024.

Chair Stevens opened the floor for questions and discussion from Commissioners. Commissioner Hatch asked Mr. Darm for clarification on the scoring methodology used for evaluating grant applications. She inquired about the mechanics behind the scoring thresholds presented in OPTION 2 (projects that scored above 410 received 100% of their requested amounts; projects that scored above 400 received 90% of their requested amounts, etc.).

Mr. Darm and Commissioner Carter discussed the scoring process used by the subcommittee to evaluate project proposals. This involved a rubric where subcommittee members assigned scores based on various criteria in the application, such as project description, evidence of need, innovation, demonstration of outcomes, and budget. Scores from all subcommittees were tallied for a total score. Each criterion was assigned a value, with scores ranging from 1 to 10 or 1 to 35, depending on the question. Extra points were awarded for innovation. Subcommittee members individually scored proposals and then discussed them collectively at the meeting [on May 16].

Commissioner Doyle asked if choosing OPTION 3 for Lake County, which proposed funding at 50% of their requested amount, would be enough for them to produce anything of value. Mr. Darm said, if the Commission were to approve OPTION 3, they could identify such issues during the contract development phase and discuss them at the next Commission meeting.

Commissioner Carter believed that the subcommittee did not want to award funding solely based on narrative (within the application); they wanted an option that considered performance as well. Despite reducing funding for Lake County with OPTION 3, she believed that once contracts were in place, spending would balance out and performance could be assessed for future allocations.

Bill Hearndon from Lake County expressed a preference for either OPTION 1 (no funding) or OPTION 2 (100% funding). He stated that OPTION 3 would not benefit Lake County, as three TNCs had already indicated that the project would not attract them to the service area. Therefore, he suggested distributing the funds to other counties. OPTION 1 will allow Lake County to regroup, conduct a formal RFP and reapply for a service development grant next year.

Chair Stevens asked Mr. Darm if there were other applicants that expressed concerns about the proposed funding adjustments to their requested amounts. Mr. Darm said the CTD staff were not aware of concerns from the other applicants. Chair Stevens preferred to see more projects funded as this is an incubator-type program.

Commissioner Hatch asked if there could be a fourth option to consider. Chair Stevens said that would require the subcommittee to reconvene and deliberate on the mathematical considerations.

Commissioner Barrios said, from a social science perspective, grant programs usually have strict standards for proposals, where a single error could disqualify an application. She questioned why decisions could not have been based solely on the application, as is often the case in other programs. Chair Stevens said the lesson learned here is that the scoring rubric did not assign weight for past performance, which is common with many selection committees. Thus, OPTION 3 was presented to account for past performance. Mr. Darm explained that any unspent funding across all grant programs would be returned to the Trust Fund and reallocated the following year. For the current fiscal year, recipients could bill the Commission for services through June 30th, after which no further billing is accepted.



Chair Stevens said the intent of the grant program is to provide services. If we are not spending the dollars, we are not getting the value out of the innovative program. Every dollar that goes back to the Trust Fund represents a lost opportunity.

With the information presented by Mr. Hearndon, Commissioner Barrios asked how this impacts the subcommittee's recommendation. Chair Stevens said the funding originally proposed for Lake County (\$81,909) could instead be reallocated to the other projects recommended under OPTION 3. Commissioner Tellez concurred. Mr. Darm said the Commission could make that decision at this business meeting, but the CTD staff would need authority to readjust the proposed allocations (i.e., those amounts could not be determined in this meeting).

Commissioner Smith asked if the Commission would need confirmation about whether other projects could deliver services under the proposed funding under OPTION 3 (with the caveat of reallocated \$81,909 to the other projects). She was concerned whether approval would tie their hands if another applicant expressed concerns about their ability to deliver services. Chair Stevens clarified that the decision today was to approve a recommendation of funding. The Commission would still need to draw up a contract with the applicant before services could be rendered. Mr. Darm explained that in the past, there have been some project contracts that were not executed, even with Commission approved funding, because of a decision made at the local level to not provide services.

Commissioner Carter stated that the Commission could amend the contract with a grant recipient if the organization could not sustain a project at the rate awarded under OPTION 3, which the Commission could then determine how to distribute the remaining funds.

Rachelle Munson, CTD General Counsel, suggested that, if the Commission approves OPTION 3 with the caveat, the motion needs to include specific direction for the CTD staff to make the modifications based on the Commission's action.

Commissioner Carter asked about Lake County's timeline for procuring a vendor. Bill Hearndon said they had a vendor on hold that he would be speaking with after the Commission meeting. If the Commission approves 100% of their requested amount (OPTION 2), he believed they could secure a contract with the vendor. However, if the Commission decided to not fund the project for FY24-25, Mr. Hearndon said this would provide an opportunity for Lake County to do a formal procurement and potentially identify other vendors. He clarified that Lake County is neutral on either option (100% or no funding) that may be decided today.

Chair Stevens requested a motion.

**ACTION TAKEN:** Commissioner Doyle moved, and Commissioner Carter seconded the motion, to approve OPTION 3, removing funds allocated for Lake County and delegating CTD staff to redistribute \$81,909 to the other approved projects for FY 2024-25. The motion carried unanimously.

Commissioner Barrios raised concerns about this decision without knowing whether the allocations would be enough for other projects to deliver services and what would be the outcome of the unspent funds. Ms. Munson said any decision to modify the funding amounts would have to be presented to the Commission for approval before action could be taken. Commissioner Barrios appreciated the clarification.

Moving forward, Mr. Darm said the Commission can assess the ISD Grant application and evaluation process and determine whether changes are needed before the next application cycle begins in 2025. Commissioner Tellez said the application process has significantly evolved since she was first

appointed. For example, the Commission added a new requirement a couple of years ago for grant recipients to provide a presentation on the status of the project.

Commissioner Doyle wanted to clarify his position: he did not want to necessarily take funding away from Lake County's project; rather, based on the information provided by Mr. Hearndon, it sounded like this would give them an opportunity to further develop their project and come back the following year with the application.

### **Annual Operating Report (AOR) Study Update**

Casey Perkins, from Thomas Howell Ferguson (THF), provided some background regarding the AOR study. Pursuant to s. 427.013(1), F.S., the Commission is required to collect data on transportation operations related to services provided to the transportation disadvantaged population in the State of Florida. The data collected from CTCs is in an "aggregated" format with limited ability to analyze. The Commission contracted with THF to assist in facilitating a study to help improve the accuracy and analyses of performance data reported in the AOR. The final report published June 30, 2023, included the following 3 recommendations which were approved by the Commission (in September 2023):

1. The Commission should collect the FY2022-23 data utilizing the current Data Collection System as in previous years.
2. The Commission should develop a detailed plan to test run the additional collection of individual trips level data, as well as individual bus pass level data, from CTCs as part of the 2023 AOR submission cycle. This test run for collecting data on individual trips and bus passes should function separately from the existing processes referenced in Recommendation #1.
3. As part of the detailed plan in Recommendation #2, a comprehensive and thorough review of legal options and authorities pertaining to the collection of data on individual trips and bus passes should be conducted to ensure that data collection practices align with legal requirements, protect privacy rights, and build a strong foundation for the ethical and responsible use of disaggregated data.

Mr. Perkins' presentation highlighted the second recommendation, which was the core focus of this year's study, to test the collection of disaggregated data on individual trips and bus passes. CTD and THF developed a working prototype (website) for the online submission of disaggregated data from CTCs. Ten CTCs participated in the test website, including: Calhoun, Citrus, Glades, Hendry, Hillsborough, Indian River, Martin, Palm Beach, St. Lucie, and Wakulla Counties.

Mr. Perkins went into more detail about the security of the prototype system. The online tool provided a link for participants to upload their data. To access the link, a PIN was required for each participant, which was provided by THF. Each county had its own webpage and password. Once the data was uploaded to the secure server, it was then immediately exported into a separate file offline. Further, based on feedback provided during the public workshop in April, THF developed another security feature that masked the names of passengers as part of the test collection, where names were replaced with numbers (e.g., "Passenger 1", "Passenger 2", etc.). Mr. Perkins provided a demonstration of how the test website functioned.

Mr. Perkins clarified that they designed the structure similar to the current AOR system – they were not proposing major changes to the overall structure; rather, their objective was to obtain the disaggregated data. The website included four tabs: general information (county, CTC name, etc.); disaggregated data on trips and bus passes; aggregated data on inventory and incidents (drivers, vehicles, complaints, etc.); and aggregated data on annual revenues and expenses. Participants had an opportunity to submit/upload their data with unlimited attempts.

Mr. Perkins explained the benefits of collecting disaggregated data allow the data to be more specific than the totals reported in the current AOR. He used the data provided by Citrus County to provide four examples of how it could be analyzed: 1) trips can be broken down and analyzed by purpose under each funding source (e.g., the highest percentage of CTD trips supported nutritional activities); 2) out-of-county trips can be identified and analyzed (e.g., how many trips were delivered outside of the service area, how many county destinations were outside of the service area, etc.); 3) trips broken down by date and days of the week (e.g., 127 trips were provided on July 1, etc.); and 4) trips broken down by times of the day (e.g., most of the pick-up times occurred between 9:00am and 10:00am). For the fourth example, he provided a scatter plot that represented all the trips by pick-off and drop-off time, which helps identify outlier trips that occur above or below average travel time (e.g., trips that were delivered to and from Hillsborough County).

Mr. Perkins concluded with discussing next steps of the study:

- Though the testing phase has concluded, the website will stay up and allow for CTCs to continue to practice submitting/uploading their data.
- THF will provide a final report at the next Commission meeting, summarizing the outcomes of the testing and recommending any technical factors to consider if the Commission approves this approach.
- CTD and THF are working with FDOT-Office of Information Technology to develop a technology proposal to host a similar website within the existing Data Collection System, if the Commission approves this approach for future AORs.

Chair Stevens noted that there was a question submitted in the chat box regarding the ownership of the data collected. He asked Mr. Perkins to clarify what organization would host the data. Mr. Perkins said the objective of the technology proposal is to host the AOR data within the Data Collection System, which is maintained by FDOT. However, THF is willing to temporarily host the website while the proposal goes through the process. He stated any data that is submitted or collected by THF will be provided to the CTD/FDOT.

Chair Stevens asked if THF was soliciting feedback from the participants of the test website as part of their technical recommendations to the Commission. He liked the visuals presented and wondered if they could be exported. Mr. Perkins said there were extensive conversations with the participants as part of their attempts to upload data, which helped with the design of the website; however, this was the first time that the data was provided in visual formats. He demonstrated how the data could be exported in different modalities (i.e., csv, jpeg, pdf, etc.).

Commissioner Hatch asked Mr. Perkins if they did any comparative analyses of what was provided by the disaggregated data versus the current aggregated data, such as whether the totals add up. She was also interested in how the disaggregated data could help inform policy decisions where the aggregated system could not. Mr. Perkins said that could be part of the report.

Chair Stevens said it was his understanding that the Commission currently does not conduct quality control on the data submission; rather, the onus is on the counties to upload accurate data into the system.

Commissioner Tellez asked about information collected about the passenger. Mr. Perkins said the only data that was collected related to the individual's name; however, some CTCs provided passenger eligibility as part of their submission.

Commissioner Carter was curious about collecting demographic data on passengers (e.g., whether they are elderly, a disabled veteran, etc.). Commissioner Hatch agreed: she thought age

would be a useful data point to include in the future. Commissioner Carter was not necessarily suggesting that such detailed information be published, but rather summarized. Chair Stevens said he would want to have legal counsel if the Commission were to collect additional data on passengers (not necessarily trip characteristics). Mr. Perkins clarified that what the Commission collects would not necessarily be included in what is reported.

Commissioner Barrios asked if the test website was compliant with Section 508 (U.S. Americans with Disabilities Act). Mr. Perkins said they would need to follow up to answer that question.

Chair Stevens stated that this was being presented as an action item on the agenda; however, the Commission will receive the final report by the end of June. He requested a motion to table this action item until after the report is published and the Commission has sufficient time to review prior to the business meeting in July.

**ACTION TAKEN:** Commissioner Tellez moved, and Commissioner Gray seconded the motion, to table the action to approve the AOR Study to the next business meeting in July. The motion carried unanimously.

This concluded the action items for the agenda.

### **Executive Director Report**

Mr. Darm provided an update on the Shirley Conroy Rural Area Capital Assistance Grant program. The applications for FY24-25 were received on Friday, May 31. The CTD staff recommended the Commission waive the subcommittee review process and allow staff to recommend projects for approval in time for the business meeting in July. Mr. Darm said he discussed this recommendation with Commissioner Renee Knight, who chairs the subcommittee, and she concurred.

Chair Stevens agreed with the recommendation. He said this would help streamline the process to accommodate the compressed schedule.

Commissioner Tellez asked if the CTD staff could explain what to expect with the Shirley Conroy Grant project for the benefit of the new board members. Mr. Darm said the staff would publish a spreadsheet in the agenda meeting packet, similar to the format of the ISD Grant applications, which would include the name of the CTC applicant, the county, the funding request, a description of the capital being purchased, and the funding recommendation to the Commission.

Chair Stevens asked how the Commission would coordinate with FDOT in developing the recommendations. Mr. Darm said the CTD staff would still work with the FDOT Transit Office as part of the review of the applications.

Commissioner Carter asked about the criteria of the application process. CTD Assistant Director Karen Somerset said the applications discuss the need and include quotes to purchase the capital. She said the Commission encourages the applicants to utilize the FDOT procurement process (TRIPS program) when making large purchases.

There was no objection to the recommendation to waive the subcommittee review process for the Shirley Conroy Grant program.

### **Commissioner and Advisor Reports**

Commissioner Hatch provided an update on their mission, emphasizing their focus on empowering individuals to thrive. They serve about 61,000 individuals across the state, offering various services including therapeutic, social, medical, and behavioral services, with a budget of about \$2.6 billion. She discussed efforts to set individuals up for success in adulthood, including the creation of an

adult pathways waiver. Commissioner Hatch expressed appreciation for legislative support, including tax credits for employers hiring individuals with unique abilities and historic funding levels for the iBudget waiver, enabling them to serve more individuals. She emphasized their commitment to continuous improvement and welcomed input from the Commission.

### **Public Comments**

No public comments were received.

### **Closing Remarks and Adjournment**

No remarks or comments were received. Chair Stevens asked for a motion to adjourn.

**ACTION TAKEN:** Commissioner Carter moved, and Commissioner Barrios seconded the motion, to adjourn the meeting. The motion carried unanimously.

*Minutes compiled by Brooke Haire.*

*Note: This meeting has been summarized to reduce paperwork in accordance with policies of State government. If an accessible format or more information than is provided herein is needed, please contact the Commission for the Transportation Disadvantaged at (850) 410-5700 or 1-800983-2435 for assistance. A copying or printing fee may be charged to the requesting party.*

**State of Florida**  
**Commission for the Transportation Disadvantaged**  
**Commission Business Meeting**

**MEETING DATE:** July 17, 2024

**AGENDA ITEM:**

VI Fiscal Year 2024-25 Shirley Conroy Rural Area Capital Assistance Grant Recommendations

**BACKGROUND**

The Florida Department of Transportation (FDOT) authorizes a transfer of \$1.4 million to the Transportation Disadvantaged Trust Fund in its 5-year work program. The purpose of the allocation is to assist rural areas with the purchase of capital equipment.

The Fiscal Year 2024-25 Grant Application packages were emailed to eligible applicants on March 15, 2024, with a deadline of May 31, 2024. Twenty applications were received requesting a total of \$2.6 million in grant funding. Of these, there were four requests for scheduling software and/or additional software modules; two requests for camera/digital video recording systems; one request for computers; one request for maintenance shop equipment; and fourteen vehicle requests. NOTE – one application can include multiple requests.

CTD and FDOT Transit staff met on June 27<sup>th</sup> to review applications and finalize recommendations. CTD staff prioritized technology requests first this year in hopes to increase system efficiencies and safety. The balance of available funding was recommended for vehicles. Vehicle recommendations were based, at a minimum, on the age and mileage of the vehicle being replaced and current vehicle orders presently awarded as part of the FDOT grants.

In anticipation of a price increase on some vehicles purchased through the FDOT TRIPS program, it is recommended that the balance remaining (\$63,850) be reserved to cover this increase.

**ATTACHMENTS:**

- Fiscal Year 2024-25 Shirley Conroy Rural Area Capital Assistance Grant Award Recommendations

**EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR RECOMMENDATION/MOTION:**

Recommend the Commission approve the grant award recommendations as presented.

DRAFT 2024-25 Shirley Conroy Rural Area Capital Assistance Program Grant Summary								
County(ies)	Applicant Name	Agency Type	Capital Equipment Requested (Prioritized as listed)	Total Project Cost (100%)	TD Dollar Amount (90% or 100% REDI)	Required Match (10% or 0% REDI)	Staff Recommendations	Recommended Funding Amounts
Alachua	MV Contract Transportation, Inc.	For Profit	One 24' cutaway vehicle with lift and safety equipment. (Replacement vehicle)	\$ 166,756.00	\$150,080.00	\$16,676.00	Not recommended at this time.	\$0.00
Baker	Baker County Council on Aging, Inc.	Non-Profit	1) Air Compressor System (Replace Piping) in maintenance shop \$5,149 2) Robinair Coolant Exchange \$3,360  Requests waiver of match.	\$ 8,509.00	\$8,509.00	\$0.00	Recommend funding coolant exchange.  Piping replacement of air compressor system in maintenance shop is not eligible for funding under this grant	\$3,360.00
Bay	Bay County Board of County Commissioners	Government	1) Spare Engage - Module that automates Rider Eligibility Application process \$10,000 2) Spare Microtransit Software annual license, implementation & customer support \$14,400 3) Base dedicated vehicle On-boarding (7 vehs)-Dispatch, Optimization, Voice, Driver Pro App, Rider Pro App \$39,648	\$ 64,048.00	\$57,643.00	\$6,405.00	Recommend funding software enhancements.	\$57,643.00
Columbia/ Hamilton/ Suwannee	Suwannee Valley Transit Authority	Government	1) ADA Compliant Minivan \$69,700 (Expansion to fleet) 2) 12 (6 laptops/docking stations & 6 desktop computers) \$24,525.58 3) ADA Compliant Minivan \$69,700 (Replacement)  Requests waiver of match.	\$ 163,925.58	\$163,925.58	\$0.00	Recommend funding computers.	\$24,526.00
DeSoto/Hardee/ Highlands/ Okeechobee	MTM Transit, LLC	For Profit	Three (3) Accessible 20' Transit Minibuses @ \$89,930.81 each.  (Replacement vehicles)	\$ 282,295.44	\$282,295.44	\$0.00	Not recommended at this time.	\$0.00
Dixie	Suwannee River Economic Council, Inc.	Non-Profit	One 23' cutaway vehicle with lift and safety equipment. (Replacement vehicle)  Requests waiver of match.	\$ 139,692.00	\$ 139,692.00	\$0.00	Not recommended at this time.	\$0.00
Gadsden	Big Bend Transit, Inc.	Non-Profit	One cutaway vehicle with lift and safety equipment - 12 amb/2 w/c (Replacement vehicle)  Requests waiver of match.	\$ 137,077.00	\$ 137,077.00	\$0.00	Recommend as requested.	\$137,077.00

DRAFT 2024-25 Shirley Conroy Rural Area Capital Assistance Program Grant Summary								
County(ies)	Applicant Name	Agency Type	Capital Equipment Requested (Prioritized as listed)	Total Project Cost (100%)	TD Dollar Amount (90% or 100% REDI)	Required Match (10% or 0% REDI)	Staff Recommendations	Recommended Funding Amounts
Holmes/ Washington	Tri-County Community Council, Inc.	Non-Profit	AngelTrax Camera/Digital Video Recording System and accessories (11 vehicles). Provides ability for real-time monitoring. System Includes all required components, shipping, removal of current system and installation.  Requests waiver of match.	\$ 60,820.29	\$60,820.29		Recommend funding system except for data plan (\$3,960) which is not eligible under this grant at this time.	\$56,860.00
Jackson	Jackson County Transportation	Non-Profit	Two (2) ADA Compliant Minivans at \$67,640 each (Replacement Vehicles)	\$ 135,280.00	\$135,280.00	\$0.00	Recommend funding one vehicle.	\$67,640.00
Jefferson	Big Bend Transit, Inc.	Non-Profit	One cutaway vehicle with lift and safety equipment - 12 amb/2 w/c (Replacement vehicle)  Requests waiver of match.	\$ 137,077.00	\$137,077.00	\$0.00	Recommend funding as requested.	\$137,077.00
Lafayette	Suwannee River Economic Council, Inc.	Non-Profit	One 23' cutaway vehicle with lift and safety equipment. (Replacement vehicle)  Requests waiver of match.	\$ 139,692.00	\$139,692.00	\$0.00	Not recommended at this time.	\$0.00
Lake	Lake County Board of County Commissioners	Government	TripSpark's NovusDR Scheduling Software to replace current outdated software. Web-based system which allows riders to request, change, cancel trips or check trip status. Includes an enhanced notification tool to automatically update riders about their ride.	\$ 148,339.00	\$133,505.00	\$14,834.00	Recommend funding software.	\$133,505.00
Levy	Levy County Board of County Commissioners	Government	One 23' cutaway vehicle with lift and safety equipment. (Replacement vehicle)  Requests waiver of match.	\$ 152,835.00	\$152,835.00	\$0.00	Not recommended at this time.	\$0.00
Madison	Big Bend Transit, Inc.	Non-Profit	One cutaway vehicle with lift and safety equipment - 12 amb/2 w/c (Replacement vehicle)  Requests waiver of match.	\$ 137,077.00	\$137,077.00	\$0.00	Recommend funding as requested.	\$137,077.00
Monroe	Guidance/Care Center, Inc.	Non-Profit	One Hybrid Minivan (Replacement)	\$ 55,794.00	\$50,214.60	\$5,579.40	Not recommended at this time.	\$0.00



DRAFT 2024-25 Shirley Conroy Rural Area Capital Assistance Program Grant Summary								
County(ies)	Applicant Name	Agency Type	Capital Equipment Requested (Prioritized as listed)	Total Project Cost (100%)	TD Dollar Amount (90% or 100% REDI)	Required Match (10% or 0% REDI)	Staff Recommendations	Recommended Funding Amounts
St. Lucie	St. Lucie County Board of County Commissioners	Government	TripSpark's NovusDR Scheduling Software to replace current outdated software. Web-based system which allows riders to request, change, cancel trips or check trip status. Includes an enhanced notification tool to automatically update riders about their ride.	\$ 250,000.00	\$225,000.00	\$25,000.00	Recommend funding software.	\$225,000.00
Taylor	Big Bend Transit, Inc.	Non-Profit	One cutaway vehicle with lift and safety equipment - 12 amb/2 w/c (Replacement vehicle)  Requests waiver of match.	\$ 137,077.00	\$137,077.00	\$0.00	Recommend funding as requested.	\$137,077.00
Union	Suwannee River Economic Council, Inc.	Non-Profit	One 23' cutaway vehicle with lift and safety equipment. (Replacement vehicle)  Requests waiver of match.	\$ 139,692.00	\$139,692.00	\$0.00	Not recommended at this time.	\$0.00
Wakulla	Wakulla Senior Citizens Council, Inc	Non-Profit	Enhanced Transportation Software to Include the following capabilities: Key Performance Indicator Tracking and Analysis; Report Creation; On-line and mobile pmt collection with detailed receipts; Incident Report Collection, Review & Mgmt.	\$ 42,140.00	\$37,926.00	\$4,214.00	Recommend funding software.	\$37,926.00
Walton	Tri-County Community Council, Inc.	Non-Profit	1) AngelTrax Camera/Digital Video Recording System and accessories (10 vehicles). Provides ability for real-time monitoring. System Includes all required components, shipping, removal of current system and installation. \$56,798.46  2) One (1) 24' cutaway vehicle with lift and safety equipment. \$128,184 (Replacement vehicle).	\$ 184,982.46	\$184,982.46	\$0.00	Recommend funding camera and digital video recording system except data plan (\$3,600). Also recommend funding vehicle.	\$181,382.00
<b>Total Funds Requested</b>					<b>\$2,610,400.37</b>		<b>Total Funds for Recommended Projects</b>	<b>\$1,336,150.00</b>
<b>Available Funding =</b>					<b>\$1,400,000.00</b>		<b>Remaining Bal of Avail Funds</b>	<b>\$63,850.00</b>

Hold balance for vehicle price increase.

**State of Florida**  
**Commission for the Transportation Disadvantaged**  
**Commission Business Meeting**

**MEETING DATE:** July 17, 2024

**AGENDA ITEM:**

VII. Annual Operating Report (AOR) Study

**BACKGROUND**

Each year, the Commission is required to collect data on transportation operations related to serving the Transportation Disadvantaged (TD) population in the State of Florida (s. 427.013(1), F.S.). These data are collected in an aggregated (summarized) format and submitted by Community Transportation Coordinators (CTCs) within their AOR (due September 15<sup>th</sup>), which the Commission then compiles within its Annual Performance Report submitted to the Governor and Legislature on January 1<sup>st</sup>, pursuant to s. 427.013(12), F.S. The Florida Department of Transportation-Office of Information Technology (FDOT-OIT) assists the CTD in managing its Data Collection System, where AOR data are submitted and stored.

For the last two years, the Commission has contracted with Thomas Howell Ferguson (THF) to assist in facilitating a study to help improve the accuracy and analyses of performance data reported in the AOR. The study explored the collection of disaggregated data (instead of just annual trip totals), which could improve the verifiability of the AOR and its capacity to be used for deeper, more extensive analyses. In September 2023, THF presented its first report and the Commission approved three recommendations, paraphrased below:

1. For the 2023 AOR submissions, the Commission should continue with the current process and collect the same information as it has in recent years.
2. The Commission should test run the collection of individual trip level data, as well as individual bus pass level data, from CTCs as part of the 2023 AOR submission cycle.
3. The Commission should conduct a comprehensive review of its legal options and authorities pertaining to the collection of disaggregated data on trips and bus passes, including potential personally identifiable details such as names or addresses.

**TEST COLLECTION OF DISAGGREGATED DATA**

Following the September 2023 Commission Business Meeting, CTD staff and THF consulted with FDOT-OIT to discuss plans for testing the collection of disaggregated data. Based on those conversations, THF developed a prototype website (CTDdata.com) for CTCs to test the online submission of their AOR data.

In Spring 2024, THF facilitated an informational webinar and invited CTCs to participate on the test website. Ten CTCs participated, where each was provided a PIN code to ensure the secure transfer of information. In response to feedback received during the webinar, all passenger names were automatically replaced with unique identifiers upon submission; that is, actual names of riders were not saved through the website. During the June 3<sup>rd</sup> Commission Business Meeting, THF presented the test website and demonstrated how the data could be analyzed for future reports.

In June 2024, THF presented its second report on the feasibility of collecting disaggregated data for future Annual Operating Reports. The report provides a background on the AOR, summarizes the objectives of the study, and discusses the features of the test website and analytical capabilities from the disaggregated data that was collected during the testing. This report fulfills Recommendation 2 from the first report that was approved by the Commission.

### **NEXT STEPS AND RECOMMENDATION**

The Commission has not completed a comprehensive review of legal options and authorities pertaining to the collection of disaggregated data (Recommendation 3 of the first report). While Chapter 427 is silent on the extent to which any data collected— by CTD or CTCs—should be summarized or broken down, the Commission may need to examine other federal and state laws pertaining to the protection of personal identifiable information, such as the Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act (HIPAA). This legal review should also consider what provisions (if any) are needed within the data sharing arrangement between the CTD and CTCs.

Further, the Commission may need additional funding and resources to store a larger volume of data within its existing Data Collection System (DCS). CTD is currently working with FDOT-OIT to develop a technology proposal that would identify these needs. If additional funding needs are identified, the Commission may require additional legislative budget authority to implement in Fiscal Year 2025-26 and beyond.

With these legal and feasibility considerations in mind, the following recommendation is presented for action at the July 17, 2024, Commission Business Meeting:

**The Commission should work to fully transition toward the collection of disaggregated data (on individual trips and bus passes) as part of the CTCs' submission of the Annual Operating Report, with a goal of being effective July 1, 2025 (FY 2025-26).**

If approved, the Commission would continue to work with FDOT to identify funding and resources needed to facilitate the collection of disaggregated data.

### **ATTACHMENTS:**

- Annual Operating Report Study – Final Report can be accessed at: [\*\*AOR Study 2 - Final Report\*\*](#)

### **EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR RECOMMENDATION/MOTION:**

Approve the recommendation to transition toward collecting disaggregated data as part of the 2025 Annual Operating Report and beyond.

**State of Florida**  
**Commission for the Transportation Disadvantaged**  
**Commission Business Meeting**

**MEETING DATE:** July 17, 2024

**AGENDA ITEM:**

VIII. Executive Director Report

David Darm will provide updates on the following topics:

- Status of Innovative Service Development (ISD) Grant Projects for FY24-25
- Implementation of CS/CS/SB 1380
- Upcoming Events and Activities for FY24-25

**EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR RECOMMENDATION/MOTION:**

For information purposes only.

## 2024-25 Innovative Service Development Grant Projects

Service Area	Applicant Name	Project Description	Requested Funding (90%)	Approved Funding * (90%)
Bay	Bay County BOCC	Continue to provide a rider's-choice, on-demand service utilizing Uber and/or Bay Co Public Transit System (BCPTS) for all trip purposes within Bay County. Service is available Monday - Saturday.	\$211,500.00	\$179,438.00
Highlands	MTM Transit, LLC	Continue to provide scheduled and on-demand transportation (same day/next day) service (between 4 and 48 hours) to TD eligible individuals who reside in Highlands County. Trips can be for any purpose but mainly for medical, employment, education and nutritional purposes. Service will be provided Monday - Friday 6:00 am - 7:00 pm and Saturday - Sunday 8:00 am - 5:00 pm.	\$140,485.00	\$129,650.00
Indian River/ St Lucie	Senior Resource Association, Inc.	Continue to partner with the St. Lucie County CTC to provide transportation to individuals with intellectual and developmental disabilities as well as other cognitive disabilities. Service is available 24 hours per day, 7 days per week. Transportation will be non-stop, door-to-door service and can be scheduled 2 hours up to 2 weeks in advance provided within and cross county between St Lucie and Indian River counties.	\$1,350,000.00	\$1,225,238.00
Leon	City of Tallahassee - StarMetro	Continue to provide same day / on-demand transportation utilizing TNCs, taxis and other service providers. Service is available Monday - Saturday 6 am - 11 pm and Sunday 11 am - 7 pm.	\$166,950.00	\$135,627.00
Martin	Senior Resource Association, Inc.	Provide same day or scheduled transportation to TD individuals who schedule their transportation utilizing the CTC's online, self-service reservations mobile app. The scheduling app is available 24 hours per day, 7 days per week and allows scheduling in real time.	\$675,000.00	\$347,738.00
Monroe (Miami)	Guidance/Care Center, Inc.	Continue to provide door-to-door trips on a planned route beginning early in the morning starting in the Lower Keys (Key West) to Miami. This service allows riders to get to earlier medical appointments and/or stay longer, if necessary. Service is available two days per week with a pickup time as early as 4 am arriving to Miami by 8 am.	\$89,410.00	\$81,766.00
Pinellas, Hillsborough and Pasco	Pinellas Suncoast Transit Authority	Continue partnership between 3 CTCs (Hillsborough, Pinellas and Pasco) to provide same day, door-to-door regional trips within the Tampa Bay Area. Service will be provided by contracted taxis, wheelchair van service provider(s) and transportation network companies based on rider's choice. In addition, a 3rd party call center to provide scheduling assistance is available, when needed, and has the ability to monitor trips.	\$518,040.00	\$455,684.00
Wakulla (Leon)	Wakulla Senior Citizens Council, Inc.	Continue to provide scheduled and on-demand transportation utilizing a Transportation Network Company (i-Enable). Eligible riders in Wakulla County will be provided trips within Wakulla County and/or cross-county trips to/from Leon County. Leon County riders will be limited to Leon County. Transportation can be provided to all TD eligible riders but will primarily focus on individuals with intellectual or developmental disabilities. Project will utilize an electronic fare collection platform. Service is available 7 days per week.	\$579,488.00	\$444,854.00
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$3,730,873.00</b>	<b>\$2,999,995.00</b>

\* After \$81,909 was equally redistributed to each project.

**State of Florida**  
**Commission for the Transportation Disadvantaged**  
**Commission Business Meeting**

**MEETING DATE:** July 17, 2024

**AGENDA ITEM:**

IV. and X. Public Comments

**BACKGROUND INFORMATION:**

When operating under Florida's Government in the Sunshine Law, the Florida Supreme Court recognizes the importance of public participation in open meetings. The Commission provides that right of access at each public meeting and adheres to Chapter 286.011, Florida Statutes.

The Commission facilitates two "Public Comments" segments on its agenda. For participants interested in providing public comments, the Commission requests speakers complete the attached public comment form and return to David Darm prior to the meeting date at [David.Darm@dot.state.fl.us](mailto:David.Darm@dot.state.fl.us). The chairman will call on speakers in the order public comment cards are received.

Participants planning to speak during the first public comments segment (Item VI) of the agenda must direct their remarks to agenda items only. The Commission welcomes input on any topic during the second public comments segment (Item XIII) of the agenda. Pursuant to Commission Rule 41-2.018, F.A.C., all speakers are limited to five minutes per public comment.

**ATTACHMENT:**

Public Comment Form



# Commission for the Transportation Disadvantaged PUBLIC COMMENT FORM

## Transportation Disadvantaged

Instructions:

1. Complete comment form, including your address. PLEASE TYPE OR PRINT
2. Email comment card to [David.Darm@dot.state.fl.us](mailto:David.Darm@dot.state.fl.us) or provide at Commission Business Meeting
3. The chairman will call on speakers in the order comment cards are received. Please indicate below whether you plan on participating via webinar or conference call.
4. Comments must be limited to five (5) minutes per speaker.

How will you be participating in this meeting? Webinar \_\_\_\_\_ Conference Call \_\_\_\_\_

Name \_\_\_\_\_

E-Mail \_\_\_\_\_

Phone \_\_\_\_\_

Address \_\_\_\_\_

City \_\_\_\_\_

Zip Code \_\_\_\_\_ County \_\_\_\_\_

Representing \_\_\_\_\_

Subject \_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

Support \_\_\_\_\_ Oppose \_\_\_\_\_ Neutral \_\_\_\_\_